

Assessment of National Tourism Development Strategies of Bulgaria

The analyze was prepared on the base on Assessment Criteria and Methodology for a National Sustainable Tourism Development Strategy of CEEweb for Biodiversity (Sustainable Tourism Working Group).

Author:
Emil Vaklinov,

Assosiation “Rhodope mountains without borders”
Assosiation „Environmental Organization – Rodope”

Bulgaria,
Smolyan town

e-mail: emil_vaklinov@yahoo.com, rhodope.eu@gmail.com

1. Introduction to Bulgarian National Tourism Strategy assessment

National Strategy for Sustainable Tourism Development *2009 - 2013* is the document of Bulgarian Ministry of Economy, Energy and Tourism which defines the priority areas and directions for tourism development.

“The most important challenge is to achieve sustainable tourism development at the local, regional, national and international level. The aim is to provide tourist practice that meets the interests and welfare of increasing local population while preserving natural and socio-cultural resources of the local environment for future generations.”

National Strategy for Sustainable Tourism Development is a concept of cost-effective development of tourism, with simultaneous preservation and restoration of tourism used by the environment and the needs of the population and tourists visiting Bulgaria as a tourist destination.

The National Strategy for Sustainable Development of tourism targets are planned actions and tools that integrate economic, social and environmental aspects and present a unified framework for the establishment of common rules, procedures and requirements for the development of strategic planning and programming

documents the sustainable development of tourism. In this sense, document will continue to evolve as the needs of the time because its main role is to give notice to potential threats in time for the sustainable development of tourism and to initiate preventive actions / activities to influence the development or updating of documents related to the regional and municipal policies and action programs.

National Strategy for Sustainable Tourism Development meets the objectives of the National Strategic Reference Framework, focusing on the rich and diverse natural and cultural heritage into account the contribution of tourism to the national growth seen tourism as a key element of local development potential and one of the engines regional and local development and calls for strengthening the regional dimension of product development, focusing on its role in economic diversification, especially in rural areas, and the protection and use of natural and cultural heritage.

The main **visions and goals** for tourism development in Bulgaria are:

Visions:

- Bulgaria will be well known and preferred by Bulgarian and foreign tourists attractive and modern year-round tourist destination, with a specific look and distinctive national identity of the environment (natural, architectural and cultural) with preserved cultural traditions and preserved a unique combination of natural resources.
- Tourism in Bulgaria will be prosperous contributor to principles of sustainable development in all its aspects - environmental, prosperity of local communities and economic growth.
- The tourism sector will be built on successful long-term partnerships at national, regional and local level between all stakeholders - national, regional and local governments, businesses, NGOs, local communities and international partners.

Goals:

The main purpose of tourism development in the period up to 2013 is to increase the competitiveness and efficiency of the tourism sector in Bulgaria through efficient use and conservation of available natural and anthropogenic resources in line with the sustainable development of tourism.

The main objective can be achieved by implementing the following strategic objectives:

1. Positioning of Bulgaria as a tourist destination in the high-end world travel market in quality and value.
2. Improving infrastructure at national, regional and municipal level.
3. Common application of international standards and best European practices and innovations in terms of products, technology and the human factor in the tourism sector in Bulgaria.
4. Preserving, protecting and improving the quality of tourism resources including the natural, cultural and anthropogenic.

Mission of the *Strategie* is as follow:

Bulgaria develop consistent and targeted tourism policy based on partnership between state and local governments, NGOs, the private sector and society that generate jobs, create opportunities for entrepreneurship development, long term economic and social benefits and increased revenues from tourism.

The Action Plan of the Strategy - 2009-2013 for identifying specific priority activities which are set apart from the respective officers, and targets for performance indicators and the necessary resources and sources of funding.

The strategy is formulated by Bulgarian Ministry of Economy, Energy and Tourism.

2. National Tourism Strategy as a public planning document

The Bulgarian Ministry of Economy, Energy and Tourism published the information of the document which is available on the public site:

www.mi.government.bg/library/index/download/lang/bg/fileId/294

The attached material consists of five items:

- a) National strategy of sustainable tourism development 2009-2013 (Bulgarian version with summary in English)
- b) Action plan of sustainable tourism strategy (Bulgarian version)
- c) National plan for sustainable development (Bulgarian version)
- d) National strategy for environment (Bulgarian version)
- e) National eco tourism strategy (Bulgarian version)

There is an Action plan of sustainable tourism strategy published on the ministerial site about realization of tasks recommended to all entities acting for tourism development in the document.

3. Sustainable tourism development foundations in the document **Challenges to biodiversity conservation, cultural Heritage and Economic Growth.**

Bulgaria was the first European country to develop and adopt a National strategy for biodiversity conservation. Since then, Bulgaria consistently developed basic legislation necessary for the implementation of modern management practices of nature. Two elements are essential to ensure the sustainability of these achievements. The first is the management of Protected areas provide benefits to the local population and the second - financial mechanisms to be developed so as to provide funds for conservation activities and to improve the livelihood opportunities of people in rural areas. Bulgaria's cultural heritage is facing same challenge. It must provide benefits for people who conserve rich national heritage and to develop financial mechanisms and incentives that allow individuals and the government to protect diversity of this heritage.¹

The realization of the objectives of the sustainable tourism strategy involves carrying out activities contributing to sustainable tourism development. This means that the following requirements:

- The development of the individual activities and investment proposals should pay particular attention to the conservation of natural areas, habitats and species by minimizing harmful effects on them to protect the biodiversity.
- Activities to implement the strategy should be tailored to Set your requirements and conservation of protected areas under the Protected Areas and Protected Areas under the Biological Diversity Act.
- To give priority to activities related to the development of eco-tourism and rural tourism as a major form of sustainable tourism.
- When selecting activities such criteria to be considered conservation biodiversity and the environment.
- To promote the development of small family hotels and guest houses, the low-rise construction, which is harmonization with the surrounding landscape and nature.

For the realization of the strategic objectives were formulated following priorities:

1. Diversification of national tourism product, the quality of the services and protect the rights and safety of consumers;

¹ Bulgarian eco tourism strategy 2004 - 2014, p. 3

2. Effective marketing and advertising of Bulgaria as a tourist destination and tourist areas.
3. Development of meeting the needs of modern tourism zoning and use of the tourist areas of monitoring, planning and directing tourism development, implementation of marketing and promotional activities in domestic and foreign markets, development of appropriate organizational structures, coordination of supply and implementation of regional differentiated state Tourism Policy incentives and regulation;
4. Increasing awareness of Bulgarian citizens opportunities to practice tourism in Bulgaria and engaging in tourism development adequate market for the Bulgarian tourist product;
5. Improving inter-institutional coordination to synchronize activities building a positive image of Bulgaria;
6. Introduction of modern standards for the use of energy-saving technologies (and energy efficiency measures) in tourism activities and implementation of standards for the preservation and protection of the environment and use of technologies for produce electricity from the sun;
7. Construction and development of modern infrastructure, responsible for capacity of the facilities in the country;
8. Encouraging the role of tourism as a crucial factor for the development of the labor market, the introduction of advanced training requirements and qualifications of the personnel and system of incentives to reduce turnover in the industry;
9. Modern integrated institutional system for managing activities related to tourism, the modernization of administrative processes, creating conditions for a level playing field and transparency of actions administrative structures. To develop public-private partnership.

"Conserving and giving value to natural and cultural heritage"

One of the strategic aims of the National Strategy for Sustainable Development of Tourism in Bulgaria 2009-2013 is preserving and giving value to tourist resources – natural and anthropological. The Strategy stresses on the need of environmentally friendly measures for development of sustainable forms of tourism e.g.

Sustainable Tourism Working Group
Assessment Criteria for National Tourism
Development Strategies, 2012



- preserving the high recreational capacity of the ecosystems and landscapes;
- promoting effective management of protected areas;
- monitoring the impact of the tourism activities on biodiversity.

The document basic information

Name of the main document representing tourism policy in the country	Years of implementation
<p>National strategy for sustainable tourism development</p> <p>Bulgarian Ministry of Economy, Energy and Tourism</p> <p>“The most important challenge is to achieve sustainable tourism development at the local, regional, national and international level. The aim is to provide tourist practice that meets the interests and welfare of increasing local population while preserving natural and socio-cultural resources of the local environment for future generations.”</p>	<p>2009 -2013</p>
Names of the complementary planning documents and initiatives (linked to the other sectors for example such as in point no.9 in the evaluation table)	Years of implementation
<p>- ...National ecotourism strategy – Ministry of Environment and Water</p> <p>The strategy outlines the development of ecotourism in Bulgaria for a period of ten years. Bulgaria has so many preconditions for the development of ecotourism strategic opportunity that deserves to become one of the main branches of the economy. Eco-tourism and cultural tourism have their specific areas of use in environments rich in natural and cultural heritage. But in certain cases they have a common field of action - integral areas that both biological diversity and valuable cultural heritage. The synthesis of natural and cultural heritage is an important Bulgarian phenomenon.</p> <p>- ...National plan for sustainable development – Ministry of Regional and Rural Development</p> <p>Areas of strategic interventions..</p> <p>The next most important areas of tourism a priority for the country spa and eco-tourism resources, which are next in popularity and density in the country. Their development will add its contribution to contribution of cultural tourism and ensure the overall sustainability of the enhanced Tourism in Bulgaria ..</p> <p>- ...National strategy for environment - Ministry of Environment and Water</p> <p>Sustainable tourism development should offer long-term source of income, but primarily to ensure the conservation and improvement of the environment, landscape and cultural heritage.</p> <p>Specific targets:</p> <p>Reducing the environmental pressures from tourism and sustainable</p>	<p>2004 – 2014</p> <p>2011 – 2015</p> <p>2009 – 2018</p>

tourism.

Integrated protection and conservation of natural and cultural heritage.

Expected Results:

Achievement of specific goals will lead to more sustainable development of the tourism sector, reducing the pressure on its environmental certification of products and services offered by the tourism sector more efficient and integrated protection and sustainable management of natural and cultural heritage of Bulgaria .

- ...National strategy for culture tourism development – Ministry of Culture

System of Cultural and Natural Resources: Strategic Guidelines
 Retraining, rehabilitation and valorisation of historical, cultural and natural values can be based on traditional methods, namely their isolation and make their own monument, but should be into account the complexity and territorial system of local identity. Requirements for the valorisation of resource-related environmental sectors Environment-culture-tourism Activities should aim at restoration and preservation of cultural and natural values through:

1. development of a regulatory framework aimed primarily define relationship between areas and sites for clarification of responsibilities, boundaries and prerogatives of the different actors;
2. restoration of old buildings and spatial structures;
3. conservation values, focussing on the relationship between historical culture, local traditions and modern interventions;
4. investigate the impact of tourist flows on conservation archaeological sites and monuments, especially for inner balance between the reception capacity, environment, archaeological value;
5. valorisation of attitude values / Nature, avoiding congestion the locations of additional services located close to the values themselves;
6. establish brand recognition and the type of reception facilities identifying the main characteristics of local identity;
7. building a network of museums throughout the territory;
8. respecting local identity of museum institutions;
9. analysis of planned activities in architecture, urban planning and territory;
10. maximum visibility and readability of the tourist offer;
11. Brand creation of the Bulgarian Tourist System;
12. preservation and study of the life and history of the Bulgarian population lands;
13. networking of additional services;
14. carry out quality publishing.

Basic principles of respect for restoration and improvement of urban historical centers of archaeological and cultural monuments.

2009

- ...National biodiversity strategy - Ministry of Environment and Water

This strategy defines ecotourism as a tool for conservation

<p>Biodiversity and field with good prospects for the development of Bulgarian economy, given the natural and cultural resources of country. Ecotourism is seen as an opportunity to ensure prosperity local communities, along with promoting the public interest to tourism and conservation. The strategy notes that ecotourism should be integrated in the process of regional and municipal planning, environmental assessments and educational programs on the environment.</p>	<p>2004</p>
<p>---National strategy for development of the rural areas - Ministry of Regional and Rural Development</p> <p>By supporting the sustainable management of land and forests, resulting biodiversity and traditional agriculture will contribute to preserving the attractiveness of rural areas will create conditions for the development of other activities of the rural economy, eg. tourism, crafts, leisure and last but not least - the development of sustainable employment for the rural population.</p>	<p>2007 – 2013</p>
<p>---National strategy for regional development - Ministry of Regional and Rural Development</p> <p>Specific Objective 4: Protection and enhancement of natural and cultural heritage</p> <p>To promote natural and cultural patterns in sustainable tourism, including health tourism. The development of large tourist resorts is among the priorities and measures of the National Development Plan. Regional policy contributes to the development of tourism functions of municipalities as an alternative and an opportunity to diversify the local economy by focusing on sustainable tourism models, including the preservation and exhibition of natural and cultural heritage. Development of recreation and tourism is supported in all areas. Reasons for this are various existing regional potential for their development, and the multiplier effect on the development of other related sectors, which affects the number of jobs created, the image of the area and attracting investment. Support for local tourism development and investment should be addressed with priority given to deprived areas with potential for tourism development.</p>	<p>2005 – 2015</p>
<p>---National strategy for Fisheries and Aquaculture - Ministry of Agriculture and Fisheries</p> <p>Strategy for sustainable development in the sector. It is important to develop measures that are in line with the strategy for sustainable development of fisheries and aquaculture, and other regional and local programs. Angling and fishing tourism can be a lucrative business for producers and will contribute to the diversification of the sector.</p>	<p>2007 – 2013</p>

The documents' achievements and future projects	Years of implementation
- ...A program for developing of the rural areas.	2007 – 2013
- ...National Strategic reference framework	2007 – 2013
- ...Action plan of sustainable tourism strategy	2009 - 2013
- ...Action plans	
- ...Tourism Law	

Methodology of assessment is based on analysis of weighted assessment and review of major tourism sustainability indicators for a tourism strategy, which are divided into several categories in the evaluation table above.

The evaluation table

Name of an indicator	Scores (S) and Weights (W)	
I Description of the document and elaboration process	W_I = 0.1	
1. The documents representing tourism policy in the country	S = 3 if yes	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - general plan of social-economic development - sectoral plan (national tourism strategy) - operative plan for government actions and agendas - the strategy is published in an easy-to-read version which does not exceed 100 pages comprising major targets 	S ₁ S ₂ S ₃ S ₄	3 3 3 3 Ad. S₁ Tourism is mentioned in National Plan of Sustainable Development (2011-2015) Areas of strategic interventions.. “The next most important areas of tourism a priority for the country spa and eco-tourism resources, which are next in popularity and density in the country. Their development will add its contribution to contribution of cultural tourism and ensure the overall sustainability of the enhanced Tourism in Bulgaria”. Ad. S₄ the document comprises of 129 pages where the first 90 pages including the main information about the strategy and in the next 39 pages supporting information, the document represent the easy-to-read vision for all stakeholders in the country in the short version of a sectoral strategy.
2. The national strategy sets out clear priorities, goals, policies, objectives, interventions and expected results that contribute to improving biodiversity protection and meeting national and global commitments in the:	S = 1 if just the long term vision (up to 10 years) is included S = 2 if sustainable tourism is included by enhancing issues where tourism can make a difference S = 3 if sustainable tourism and biodiversity protection is included	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - vision of national tourism policy - goals of national tourism policy 	S ₅ S ₆	3 3

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - objectives of national tourism policy - operational measures/tasks - expected results/indicators - expected results (outcomes) of national tourism policy 	<p>S₇ S₈ S₉ S₁₀</p>	<p>3 2 2 3</p> <p>Ad. The national sustainable tourism strategy has clear goals and vision. The operational measures and task have to be more clear and better defined.</p>
<p>3. Targets or norms are established by governments (in other strategic documents as well) considering areas such as:</p>		<p>S = 1 if the relevant planning document exists S = 2 if the tourism issues are included in the document S = 3 if the tourism issues and biodiversity protection is included S = 4 if there are targets set which influence tourism sector S = 5 if there are targets set which influence tourism sector and biodiversity protection</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - land-use zoning - ecosystem functioning - biodiversity conservation and sustainable use - sustainable transport - green house gas reduction in the tourism industry - climate change adaptation and mitigation in destinations - waste reduction and management - poverty alleviation/mitigation 	<p>S₁₁ S₁₂ S₁₃ S₁₄ S₁₅ S₁₆ S₁₇ S₁₈</p>	<p>3 3 5 4 2 3 2 2</p> <p>Ad. This part is better defined in other strategic documents like Action plan of the sustainable tourism strategy, National biodiversity strategy, National strategy for environment, National strategy for Fisheries and Aquaculture and National strategy for development of the rural areas.</p>

<p>4. Strategy formulation process includes the following actions:</p>	<p>S = 1 if the information about the document formulation is available for stakeholders S = 2 if the stakeholders are invited to the meetings or other form of involvement into the formulation process S = 3 if the active contribution was accompanied by research on the type of tourism the stakeholders want to host</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - baseline information is gathered on the basis of multi-stakeholder consultations - local communities are involved in the consultations and their active role in destination management is recognized - public and private sector work together during the consultations 	<p>S₁₉ S₂₀ S₂₁</p>	<p>3 2 2</p>
<p>II Situation analysis and programming</p>		<p>W_{II} = 0.2</p>
<p>5. The tourism resources and market analysis for national tourism development</p>	<p>S = 1 if there are major stakeholders and elements of supply and demand of tourism market included S = 2 if there are major stakeholders and elements of supply and demand of tourism market included (including separate analysis of country's tourism destination and regions) S = 4 if there are major stakeholders and elements of supply and demand of tourism market included (comprising separate analysis of country's tourism destination and regions) and natural resources are presented from the point of view of ecosystem services</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - domestic (national) market: major stakeholders (tour operators, travel agents, national and regional authorities, NGOs etc.) - tourism supply: products, services, infrastructure and facilities - demand of the domestic market (income, costs, positive and negative trends in demand, working hours) - strategic planning method analysis (e.g. SWOT) 	<p>S₂₂ S₂₃ S₂₄ S₂₅</p>	<p>4 4 4 4</p>

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - needs for further development and official forecasts 	S ₂₆	4
<p>6. Political factors and international aspects of tourism development</p>	<p>S = 1 if the description includes the national destination only S = 2 if the description includes the national and regional destinations S = 3 if the description includes the national and regional destinations and their <i>competitiveness</i> is described</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - product and infrastructure development, general industrial policy starting points - destination marketing - reinforcing the image of the country as a tourist destination - benchmarking (product, strategic) - the strategy gives the answer to which type of tourism is best for the national destination 	S ₂₇	2
	S ₂₈	3
	S ₂₉	3
	S ₃₀	2
	S ₃₁	3
<p>III The grade of enhancement on sustainable approach to tourism in policies</p>	<p>W_{III} = 0.1</p>	
<p>7. Linkage of tourism to other sectors (the grade of complementation of management documents of the following sectors with tourism development planning)</p>	<p>S = 1 if there are tourism issues involved in documents S = 3 if there are targets within the documents which define how tourism will help to solve problems of other sector (e.g. agrotourism complements aims of rural development strategy) S = 5 if there are targets within the documents which define how tourism will help to solve problems of other sector involving the quality of live for host and visitor S = 6 if there are targets within the documents which define how tourism will help to solve problems of other sector involving the quality of live for host and visitor and there is a special chapter in tourism strategy describing the connections</p>	

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - environmental policy - agriculture and forestry - regional and rural development policy - transport strategy - health policy - employment policy 	<p>S₃₂ S₃₃ S₃₄ S₃₅ S₃₆ S₃₇</p>	<p>5 3 5 5 5 3</p> <p>Ad.S33. The linkage to the agriculture and the forestry is not enough clear. It will be good if there is more structural information.</p>
<p>8. Reference to sustainable tourism agreements, conventions, protocols, EU policy towards development of sustainable tourism and nature conservation:</p>	<p>S = 2 if there is a reference to at least 1 document S = 3 if there is a reference to 2 S = 4 if there is a reference to more than 2</p>	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) the Global Code of Ethics for Tourism (GCET) as a comprehensive set of principles designed to guide key-players in tourism development (WTO) 2) the United Nations Convention on Biological Diversity, especially Decision VII/14 Biological Diversity and Tourism and Decision V/25: Biodiversity and tourism, 2004 3) The Charter for Sustainable Tourism (developed in Lanzarote, Canary Islands) Spain, 1995 4) EU Sustainable Development Strategy (EU SDS) with indications for national policies on law foundation for sustainable development of tourism, implementation of principles for tourism in other sectors of state activity and enhancement on scientific research on relations between tourism development and environment protection 5) the Agenda for a Sustainable and Competitive European Tourism 6) European Charter for Sustainable Tourism in Protected Areas 7) Agenda 21 as a comprehensive plan of action to be taken by governments in every area in which human impacts on the environment, Rio de Janeiro, 1992 	<p>S₃₈</p>	<p>4</p>

<p>8) The Pan-European Biological and Landscape Diversity Strategy (PEBLDS) adopted at the 3rd Ministerial Conference "An Environment for Europe", Sofia, 1995</p> <p>9) EU Strategy for the Danube Region, the Carpathian Convention (Tourism Protocol)</p> <p>10) Other related to sustainable tourism development (fill with the name):</p> <p>10.1) The strategy of Lisboa 2002;</p> <p>10.2) Agenda 21 for tourism and travel Industry. Towards environmentally Sustainable Development. WTO, WTCC, Earth Council, 1996;</p>													
<p>9. Social benefits and community profits</p>	<p>S = 3 if there are outcomes defining how tourism will contribute to the evaluated issue</p> <p>S = 4 if there are outcomes defining how tourism will contribute to the evaluated issue and recommendations for regional level tourism development strategies are included</p>												
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - tourism is valued as the contributor to country's economy (preferably in %) - preservation and development of the culture in the region - distribution of income and prospects for employment - support to cultural heritage and local identity - maintenance of community infrastructure - participation of indigenous and local communities (e.g. community based tourism) 	<table border="0"> <tr><td>S₃₉</td><td>4</td></tr> <tr><td>S₄₀</td><td>4</td></tr> <tr><td>S₄₁</td><td>4</td></tr> <tr><td>S₄₂</td><td>4</td></tr> <tr><td>S₄₃</td><td>3</td></tr> <tr><td>S₄₄</td><td>3</td></tr> </table> <p>Ad. The information about the social benefits and community profits is not enough in the document.</p>	S ₃₉	4	S ₄₀	4	S ₄₁	4	S ₄₂	4	S ₄₃	3	S ₄₄	3
S ₃₉	4												
S ₄₀	4												
S ₄₁	4												
S ₄₂	4												
S ₄₃	3												
S ₄₄	3												
<p>IV Participation of institutions in tourism management</p>	<p>W_{IV} = 0.1</p>												
<p>10. Setting up and enabling a National Tourism Organization as:</p>	<p>S = 3 if yes</p>												

Sustainable Tourism Working Group
 Assessment Criteria for National Tourism
 Development Strategies, 2012



<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - a national body for tourism businesses and destinations - a source of best practice, offering tourism business advice - a custodian of the national product database 	S ₄₅	3
	S ₄₆	3
	S ₄₇	3
11. Enhancement on bottom – up approach in destination management	S = 3 if yes	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - local tourism bodies are responsible for a tourism destination which reflects the natural geography of an area's visitor economy (rather than local public sector or electoral boundaries) - the tourism policy gives the possibility for tourism bodies to band together into larger groups voluntarily - ensuring financial sustainability of the bodies with minimum reliance on public funds (can act as partners with local authorities or local business partnerships) - reduction of taxes to central level - supporting creation of <i>Destination Management Organization</i> rather than Marketing Organizations - partnership between public sector and local authorities and local businesses and attractions - recognition of role of the bodies for Regional Development Strategies 	S ₄₈	3
	S ₄₉	3
	S ₅₀	3
	S ₅₁	-
	S ₅₂	3
	S ₅₃	3
	S ₅₄	3
12. There are responsibilities determined for the strategy implementation for the following bodies:	S = 5 if yes	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - ministries - the local and regional governments - tourism business associations, clusters, tourism entrepreneurs etc. - the non-governmental sector - protected area authorities, environmental institutions etc. 	S ₅₅	5
	S ₅₆	5
	S ₅₇	5
	S ₅₈	5
	S ₅₉	5
V Sustainable development of tourism businesses, supply of services and special enhancement addressing nature protected areas	W_V = 0.2	



<p>13. Plans to increase the number of environmentally oriented tourism providers and offerings by:</p>	<p>S = 1 if recommendations of the following actions are listed S = 2 if there are operative actions described for the implementation S = 3 if there are operative actions described and indicated bodies responsible for the implementation of these actions</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - support of certification and labelling schemes - strengthening cooperation between (organisation and financing) public and private entities as well as partnerships for sustainable tourism development - educational programs for tourist staff and their professionalization in the framework of tourism environmental impact and social responsibility 	<p>S₆₀ S₆₁ S₆₂</p>	<p>3 2 2</p>
<p>14. Grade of incentive and encouragement to sustainable practices in tourism companies:</p>	<p>S = 1 if country has sustainable policy for resources management with relevant legislation S = 2 if the legislation provides alternatives for resources' using S = 3 if state government stimulates sustainable practice with finance benefits (tax reducing, tariff reducing)</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - energy efficiency - efficient water management solutions - waste management 	<p>S₆₃ S₆₄ S₆₅</p>	<p>3 3 1</p>
<p>15. Support for financial contribution from the tourism industry to nature protection services:</p>	<p>S = 3 if there are: a system or instruments with relevant legislation and rules S = 4 if there is evidence (data) that stakeholders use these instruments</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - enhancing regional marketing as the foundation for sustainable tourism development, particularly in UNESCO biosphere reserves and national parks - areas close to or in populated regions are protected for nature-based recreation - incorporating the European Union network of Natura 2000 sites in tourism 	<p>S₆₆ S₆₇ S₆₈</p>	<p>3 4 4</p>

territorial development and marketing	<p>Ad. The main support for the tourism industry and nature protection services are carried out by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • State budget - through the budgets of the STA and other ministries and agencies within their jurisdiction and responsibilities set out in the strategy measures and activities; • The budgets of municipalities - within their competence and responsibilities a planned strategy measures and activities; • Operational Programmes under the Structural and Cohesion Funds and Programme for Rural Development 2007-2013, financed by the European Agricultural Fund for Rural Development; 	
VI Tourism strategy measures	W_{VI} = 0.1	
16. Indicators and targets comprise important part of the strategy	<p>S = 4 if yes If no go to indicator no. 18</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - strategy includes targets to be fulfilled - strategy recommends indicators for monitoring - targets are combined with indicators in order to measure impacts 	<p>S₆₉ S₇₀ S₇₁</p>	<p>4 4 4</p>
17. Indicators for monitoring are described in 8 groups ² as headline indicators (not only complementary indicators):	<p>S=0 if the indicator is not included in the strategy S= 1 if the indicator is included in the strategy</p>	
<p>(a) political</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - value of micro-loan program for local businesses respecting sustainability criteria and number of SMEs (Small and Medium Enterprises) supported by the programme - measures for evaluating tourist information policy (grade of including sustainability criteria in tourism promotion) 	S ₇₂	0

² According to *Conceptual framework for tourism sustainability assessment* by T.G. Ko [in] *Development of a tourism sustainability assessment procedure: a conceptual approach*, Tourism Management 26 (2005) 431-445, Science Direct and *Criteria for sustainable tourism*, *Tourism for Nature* GEF project's publication.

e.g. communicating access code for tourists, evaluation of tourist behaviour, knowledge and attitudes)	S ₇₃	1
- measures to policy for disabled people and equal access to tourism	S ₇₄	1
- the map of regional supply chains through the establishment of local or regional cooperation (e.g. territorial communes tourist associations, clusters)	S ₇₅	1
- measures of participation and local control (measures of accessibility to information about the strategy, number of people and stakeholders that participated in decision-making process and the quality of their participation)	S ₇₆	1
- existence and quality of management plans, visitor regulations and monitoring measures	S ₇₇	0
(b) economic		
- value of tourism expenditure in tourism destination by target groups of tourist (annual growth) or change in visitor spending	S ₇₈	1
- percentage of GDP coming from tourism	S ₇₉	1
- measures taken to reduce the dependency on tourism and seasonality (percentage of income coming from tourism in the time-scale of the year, percentage of fulltime, part time and seasonal jobs in tourism, local unemployment rate off-season, local unemployment rate off-season)	S ₈₀	1
- length of average tourist stay (in days)	S ₈₁	1
- percentage of people employed in tourism or tourism related jobs	S ₈₂	1
- percentage of change in the total number of tourists	S ₈₃	1
- growth in % of the surface of the areas which are used for tourism	S ₈₄	1
(c) socio-cultural		
- increase/decrease in cultural activities or traditional events and level of participation	S ₈₅	1
- level of awareness of local values and cultural heritage	S ₈₆	1
- number of local businesses related to the local culture (handicrafts, music, food)	S ₈₇	0
- extent of traditional land use	S ₈₈	0
- number and quality of infrastructure development stimulated by tourism	S ₈₉	1
- percentage of locals using tourism related infrastructure	S ₉₀	1
- proportion of tourism revenues reinvested by administration in public responsibilities	S ₉₁	0

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - tourism's contribution to the preservation of cultural goods - evaluation of the local inhabitants' experiences with and attitudes towards tourism (percentage of locals who are satisfied with tourism development) - evaluation of the tourists' experience 	<p>S₉₂ S₉₃ S₉₄</p>	<p>1 1 1</p>
<p>(d) service and product quality</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - number of Green Tourism Business Awards - number and type of tourism attractions, tourism products and visitor infrastructure - quality measures of accommodation, food, transport and other services - evaluation of safety - tourists' satisfaction evaluation (percentage of return visitors, visitor expectations versus experience measure, satisfaction rating for those visitors whose experience exceeded their expectations (in 1-5 scale, 1 (much worse than expected) to 5 (much better than expected)) - length of the tourism season - existence and quality of visitor/information centers, interpretative materials (e.g. brochures, panels), guided tours, trails, cycling routes, signage (length of trails, number and language of signs) - level of training (guards, guides, information, catering, management, etc.) 	<p>S₉₅ S₉₆ S₉₇ S₉₈ S₉₉ S₁₀₀ S₁₀₁ S₁₀₂</p>	<p>1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1</p>
<p>(e) general environmental impacts</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - intensity of use (tourist/hectare or km of trails, carrying capacity indicators, level of use of protected areas and natural environment) - percentage of tourism businesses with appropriate resource management - behavior and attitudes of tourists and locals towards environmental protection - type and extension of protected areas, percentage of extended surface of protected areas and creation of new ones 	<p>S₁₀₃ S₁₀₄ S₁₀₅ S₁₀₆</p>	<p>1 1 0 1</p>
<p>(f) ecosystem quality</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - revenue from tourism allowed to environment protection activity - number and quality of direct engagement of tourism business in projects and programmes for the improvement of environment 	<p>S₁₀₇ S₁₀₈</p>	<p>1 1</p>

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - effectiveness of resource management measured e. g. by amount of waste and water consumed per tourist per day - scale of impacts due to tourism infrastructure (e. g. erosion caused by trails, consumption of territory) - type and percentage of transport facilities used (tourists arriving by car, train, etc., number of tourists using public transport) 	S ₁₀₉ S ₁₁₀ S ₁₁₁	0 0 0
<p>(g) biodiversity</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - percentage of endangered species - habitat status changes measures - monitoring of tourist flow is mentioned - tools for tourist flow mitigation are previewed 	S ₁₁₂ S ₁₁₃ S ₁₁₄ S ₁₁₅	0 1 1 0
<p>(h) environmental policy and management</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - amount of financial contribution of tourism to funding of conservation - number and type of measures to engage locals in protection activities (meetings, programs, expenditure) - percentage of locals actively involved in conservation activities - percentage of tourism managers with environmental training - percentage of tour operators and hotels with an environmental strategy or policy - existence of a land use or development planning process including tourism - existence of the environmental impact assessment legal procedure 	S ₁₁₆ S ₁₁₇ S ₁₁₈ S ₁₁₉ S ₁₂₀ S ₁₂₁ S ₁₂₂	1 1 1 1 1 1 1
<p>VII Financing and Implementation of the National Tourism Strategy</p>	<p>W_{VII} = 0.2</p>	
<p>18. Financing</p>	<p>S = 1 if there are indicated concrete institutions who are responsible for financing S = 2 if there is indicated concrete amount for each measure implementation</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - financing is secured through governmental and voluntary resources for the entire period of the strategy - the strategy implementation is accompanied by a micro-loan program for local 	S ₁₂₃ S ₁₂₄	1 1

businesses respecting sustainability criteria		
19. Monitoring and Evaluation	S = 0 if no S = 3 if yes	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - M&E is a substantial part of the strategy - the strategy has clearly described ways and means of monitoring, including the responsible body and intervals of monitoring - the periodical monitoring is made public - there are simple qualitative along with quantitative data gathering means employed (household survey of local residents and visitor questionnaire, Delphi technique or in-depth interviews or focus group interviews of environmental expert groups) - tourism research on tourism market (product quality, visitor satisfaction with products and marketing) as well as relation tourism-environment (contribution of tourism to community economies, impact on nature and support for nature protection) in academic and expert institutions will assist and complement the strategy monitoring analysis - there is a specification of data sources for strategies' evaluation (according to what data is available at national level and where the new research is required) 	<p>S₁₂₅ 3</p> <p>S₁₂₆ 3</p> <p>S₁₂₇ 0</p> <p>S₁₂₈ 3</p> <p>S₁₂₉ 3</p> <p>S₁₃₀ 0</p>	
20. Execution	S = 1 if there are roles and responsibilities for private and public sector (governmental institutions, NGO, etc.) S = 2 if there is given time scale for each strategy measurement S = 3 if there is a financing for implementation	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the strategy identifies clear roles and responsibilities of various stakeholders for the implementation of the strategy - the strategy has an integrated adaption tool, which allows for the review of the strategy after a given period of max. 10 years 	<p>S₁₃₁ 3</p> <p>S₁₃₂ 2</p>	

Total Score (TS) = $W_I \cdot \sum S_{1-21} + W_{II} \cdot \sum S_{22-31} + W_{III} \cdot \sum S_{32-44} + W_{IV} \cdot \sum S_{45-59} + W_V \cdot \sum S_{60-68} + W_{VI} \cdot \sum S_{69-122} + W_{VII} \cdot \sum S_{123-132}$	TS = 37
Maximum Score (MS) = 45	
Percentage in which a strategy fulfills given indicators (P) $P = (TS / MS) \times 100\%$	P = 82,22

Ad 1. Recommendations:

1. The operational measures of the existing strategy (2007 -2013) should be more clear and better defined.
2. The new strategy (2014 - 2020) should include:
 - 2.1 clearly defined guidance on how to involve the local communities in protecting biodiversity and securing it as a basis of sustainable tourism development,
 - 2.2 detailed and clear description about the possible social benefits and community profits,
 - 2.3. long-term analysis of the expected benefits of proper management of natural resources and their impact on sustainable development.
 - 2.4 applied indicators for effectiveness of resource management, e.g. amount of waste and water consumed per tourist per day, scale of impacts due to tourism infrastructure (e. g. erosion caused by trails, consumption of territory) and type and percentage of transport facilities used (tourists arriving by car, train, and number of tourists using public transport), percentage of endangered species and tools for tourist flow mitigation are previewed.

Glossary

Communication - non-binding decision of the EU institutions such as communications of the Commission on various topics, Court judgments, opinions of the Committee of the Regions or the Economic and Social Council

National Tourism Strategy - planning documents formulated in order to define visions, goals and directions of tourism state policies

EU Biodiversity Strategy to 2020 (COM(2010) 2020) – the strategy that has adopted by the European Commission on 3rd of May, 2011 to halt the loss of biodiversity and ecosystem services in the EU by 2020. The strategy is aimed at reversing biodiversity loss and speeding up the EU's transition towards a resource efficient and green economy.

Resources

1. Action For More Sustainable European Tourism, Report of the Tourism Sustainability Group, 2007.
2. Biological Diversity and Tourism: Development of Guidelines for Sustainable Tourism in Vulnerable Ecosystems, Secretariat of the Convention on Biological Diversity, 2002.
3. Bramwell B., Lane B. [2000] Tourism Collaboration and Partnerships. Politics, Practice and Sustainability, Channel View Publications, Clevedon.
4. Criteria for sustainable tourism, *Tourism for Nature* GEF project's publication.
5. Finland's Tourism Strategy to 2020, Four good reasons to promote tourist industry development.
6. Government Tourism Policy, Department for Culture, Media and Sport, Great Britain, March 2011.
7. Hall C.M. [2000] Rethinking Collaboration and Partnership: A Public Policy Perspective [in] Tourism Collaboration and Partnerships. Politics, Practice and Sustainability, Channel View Publications, Clevedon.
8. http://ec.europa.eu/enterprise/sectors/tourism/documents/communications/commission-communication-2007/index_en.htm
9. http://ec.europa.eu/enterprise/sectors/tourism/documents/communications/index_en.htm
10. <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=CELEX:52007DC0621:en:HTML>
11. <http://www.bmu.de/english/nature/downloads/doc/41253.php>
12. Ko T.G. [2005] *Development of a tourism sustainability assessment procedure: a conceptual approach*, Tourism Management 26, Science Direct, p.431-445.
13. Making Tourism More Sustainable. A Guide for Policy Makers, UNEP/WTO, 2005.
14. New Zealand Tourism Strategy 2015, Ministry of Tourism, Wellington, 2007.
15. The CBD Guidelines on Biodiversity and Tourism Development, Secretariat of the Convention on Biological Diversity, Montreal, Quebec, 2004.
16. Turystyka [2007] red. W. Kurek, Wydawnictwo Naukowe PWN, Warszawa.
17. Zareba D. [2006] Ekoturystyka, Wydawnictwo Naukowe PWN, Warszawa, s. 44-45.

The tourism planning system in Bulgaria

